Belomar 3-C Plan

The consolidated public participation and civil rights plan for continuing, comprehensive, and cooperative (3-C) public accessibility to participate in transportation decisions.



Bel-O-Mar Transportation Study (Belomar)

Belomar 3-C Plan

Wheeling, WV-OH Urban Area

105 Bridge Street Plaza

Wheeling, WV 26003



Submit Comments by Mail or Office Address

Attn: Transportation Planning Director Bel-O-Mar Transportation Study (Belomar) 105 Bridge Street Plaza Wheeling, WV 26003

Submit Comments by Web Survey through Belomar's Open Comments page: https://www.belomar.org/open_comments/

Direct web survey link url: https://arcg.is/0CjmGi Direct

Web survey QR code:





Contents

| Introduction | 3 |
|---|----|
| Compliance | 3 |
| (a) Participation Plan Development(1) Required Participation Procedures and Strategies | |
| (2) Summary of Public Comments | 4 |
| (3) Minimum Public Comment Period | 4 |
| (b) Consultation with Other Planning Entities | 4 |
| (e) Documented Public Consultation ProcessesUS Civil Rights in Transportation Planning | |
| (a) People with Limited English Proficiency (LEP) Accommodations | 6 |
| (b) Accessibility Accommodations Ongoing Review and Updates | |
| Key Principles and the Fourth "C" | 7 |
| Belomar also emphasizes a fourth "C": Consistency: | 7 |
| Interested parties | 8 |
| Open Comment Portal and Public Access Metropolitan Transportation Plan (MTP) Development | |
| TIP Development | 10 |
| Public Participation and Civil Rights Plan (Belomar 3-C Plan) Development | 10 |
| Procedures for Late Comments and Comments Received After Publication | 11 |
| Commitment to Consistency in Public Engagement | 11 |
| Conclusion | 12 |
| Appendix 1: Glossary of Common Technical Transportation Terms | 13 |

Belomar 3-C Plan



The consolidated public participation and civil rights plan for continuing, comprehensive, and cooperative (3-C) public accessibility to participate in transportation decisions.

Introduction

The Belomar Regional Council's 3-C Plan ensures a Continuing, Comprehensive, and Cooperative approach to public participation in transportation planning. This plan consolidates requirements from U.S. Civil Rights Laws and public participation policies to maximize accessibility, transparency, and compliance.

Belomar recognizes that transportation planning should be open to all, ensuring that all community members, including people with disabilities, people living with income below the federal poverty level, and non-English speakers, have fair access to participation. Belomar will use a variety of engagement methods to ensure meaningful participation in the metropolitan transportation planning process.

Compliance

(a) Participation Plan Development

Belomar's participation plan ensures that individuals, affected public agencies, transportation employees, freight shippers, private providers of transportation, users of pedestrian and bicycle facilities, people living with disabilities, affordable housing organizations, and other interested parties have opportunities to be involved in the transportation planning process.

(1) Required Participation Procedures and Strategies

- (i) Public Notice and Review: Belomar provides adequate public notice of participation activities and allows reasonable time for public review and comment at key decision points.
- (ii) Timely Access to Information: All transportation planning documents, public meeting notices, and related materials are made available in a timely and accessible manner.
- (iii) Visualization Techniques: Belomar employs visualization tools, such as interactive maps and infographics, to effectively describe transportation plans and projects.
- (iv) Online Accessibility: Public information is provided in electronically accessible formats, including the official Belomar website and social media.



- (v) Accessible Public Meetings: Meetings are held at convenient times and locations, ensuring wheelchair access.
- (vi) Public Input Consideration: Belomar documents, considers, and responds to public comments received throughout the planning process.
- (vii) Addressing Underserved Populations: Belomar actively identifies and engages underserved communities, ensuring their needs are represented.
- (viii) Additional Public Comment Opportunities: If significant changes occur between the draft and final transportation plan, an additional public comment period is provided.
- (ix) Coordination with Statewide Planning: Belomar aligns its participation plan with state and regional planning processes.
- (x) Effectiveness Review: The participation plan is periodically reviewed to ensure continuous improvement.

(2) Summary of Public Comments

A comprehensive summary, analysis, and response to significant written and oral comments is included in the final metropolitan transportation plan and Transportation Improvement Program (TIP).

(3) Minimum Public Comment Period

A minimum 45-day public comment period is provided before adopting or amending the participation plan. The final plan is posted online and submitted to FHWA and FTA.

(b) Consultation with Other Planning Entities

Belomar seeks to coordinate with agencies responsible for related planning activities, including:

- State and local growth, economic development, and tourism agencies
- Natural disaster risk reduction and environmental protection organizations
- Airport and freight movement entities
- Recipients of Federal assistance

Belomar seeks to involve these entities by directly involving them in the TAC or inviting them to Public Open Houses for plan development.

(c) Tribal Government Consultation



There are no tribal government entities in the Belomar region.

(d) Federal Land Management Consultation

Ohio River Islands National Wildlife Refuge (USFWS)

The Ohio River Islands National Wildlife Refuge is the primary federally managed land in the region, managed by U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service (USFWS). This refuge protects wildlife habitats along the Ohio River in West Virginia and Ohio. Notable federally owned parcels in the Belomar region include:

- Captina Island (Marshall County, WV)
- Fish Creek Island (Marshall County, WV)
- Wheeling Island (Ohio County, WV partially protected)

Belomar will seek to enhance the participation of representatives of the USFWS, operators of protected historic properties, and managers of protected parks in the development and decision-making of the metropolitan transportation planning process. Belomar will do this by reviewing its TAC contact list and involving appropriate representatives in the TAC.

(e) Documented Public Consultation Processes

Belomar maintains a documented process outlining roles, responsibilities, and key decision points for intergovernmental consultation, as required by federal regulations.

Belomar openly accepts continuous comments on all its planning products at any stage of a plans development.

US Civil Rights in Transportation Planning

Belomar ensures full compliance with US Civil Rights laws and their relationship with transportation planning:

- Identifying and addressing barriers for public participation for all.
- Providing multilingual materials for people with limited English proficiency upon request.
- Ensuring fair transportation investments that do not disproportionately burden any protected class by providing analysis upon request.



- Developing partnerships with community groups and targeted engagement for zero-vehicle households and people living with incomes below the federal poverty level.
- Providing reasonable language assistance services, including translation and interpretation services, upon request.

Any individual who believes they have been denied reasonable access due to their statues in a class protected by US Civil Rights laws may file a complaint with Belomar. https://www.belomar.org/open_comments/

(a) People with Limited English Proficiency (LEP) Accommodations

To ensure accessibility for individuals with limited English proficiency, Belomar will:

- Provide Spanish-speaking translators and American Sign Language (ASL) interpreters upon request for public meetings.
 - Attempt to provide translators for other languages upon request.
- Develop and maintain on-call contracts with professional translation and interpretation service providers to meet language needs as they arise.
- Offer written translations of key documents in languages commonly spoken within the region, as determined by demographic data.
 - Belomar has identified Spanish as a commonly spoken language in the region.
- Utilize language identification cards and signage at public meetings to help LEP individuals request language assistance.
- Ensure public notices include information on how to request language assistance services at no cost by accessing the public comments posted in all plans and public notices.

Any individual who believes they have been denied reasonable access due to LEP may file a complaint with Belomar. https://www.belomar.org/open comments/

(b) Accessibility Accommodations

Belomar will ensure that all public meetings and engagement opportunities comply with the US Civil Rights laws as they pertain to accessibility. Belomar will provide reasonable accommodations upon request, but not limited to:

- Assistive listening devices and hearing aids.
- Braille or large-print materials for people with low vision.



- Physical accessibility accommodations for individuals with mobility impairments.
- Any other reasonable accommodations requested in advance of public meetings.

Belomar will conduct accessibility evaluations of the physical space and infrastructure at usual meeting locations and make plans to remedy any deficiencies. Belomar will seek to develop and maintain on-call contracts with professional accessibility services.

Any individual who believes they have been denied reasonable access may file a complaint with Belomar. https://www.belomar.org/open comments/

Ongoing Review and Updates

This plan will be periodically reviewed and updated to align with the latest federal regulations and best practices for public engagement.

Belomar will also measure the effectiveness of engagement efforts through public feedback, participation metrics, and survey data, ensuring continuous improvement. Live public participation tracking results, which began in December of 2024 can be viewed here: Public Meeting Outreach Tracking.xlsx

Further analysis can be conducted on the data upon request.

Key Principles and the Fourth "C"

Belomar strives to implement the key principles of the federally required 3-C planning process:

- Comprehensive Planning efforts ensure that all voices are heard, research is thorough, and public engagement is accessible and meaningful for everyone.
- Continuing The planning process is ongoing, adapting to changing needs and priorities while maintaining long-term regional goals.
- Cooperative Belomar works collaboratively with the public, interagency partners, local governments, and interested parties to develop well-coordinated solutions.

Belomar also emphasizes a fourth "C": Consistency:



- Public comments can always be submitted through consistent and accessible channels.
- Documents follow a standardized format and for clarity and ease of use.
 - Documents and public meetings aim to balance plain language in place of technical jargon and acronyms.
 - o Belomar aims to educate the public on technical jargon and acronyms.
- Notices of key decision points and public comment opportunities are posted in the same locations for transparency.
- Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) and Policy Committee meetings are scheduled consistently, and the public is welcome to attend and participate in discussions.

By upholding these four principles—Comprehensive, Continuing, Cooperative, and Consistent—Belomar ensures an inclusive, transparent, and effective transportation planning process where no one is excluded from participation based on their protected status.

Implementation of the 3-C Principles and Public Engagement Procedures

Belomar is committed to ensuring that transportation planning remains Comprehensive, Continuing, Cooperative, and Consistent through well-defined public engagement and decision-making processes. Below are the key methods by which Belomar ensures transparency, accessibility, and predictability in its public participation efforts.

Interested parties

Belomar will evaluate its TAC meeting contact list to include representatives of all interested parties in TAC meeting notices. Belomar will conduct outreach efforts to encourage participation of interested parties in the TAC.

Open Comment Portal and Public Access



Belomar encourages public input at all stages of the planning process through its Open Comments Portal (https://www.belomar.org/open comments/) and office address. The public may request to view and comment on any Belomar planning product at any time, including during:



QR Code for public comments and accessibility requests

- The initial development phase
- Key decision points prior to adoption
- · Post-publication and approval

Public comments on specific planning stages must be received by the deadline listed in Public Notices, which are always posted on Facebook and in legal advertisements.

The Open Comments Portal is also the designated portal for submitting civil rights or public accessibility

complaints, as well as for requesting translation services or accessibility enhancements for a meeting or document.

Individuals with limited internet access or computer proficiency may submit comments by mail or in person at:

Submit Comments by Mail or Office Address Attn: Transportation Planning Director Bel-O-Mar Transportation Study (Belomar) 105 Bridge Street Plaza Wheeling, WV 26003

Public Participation Procedures for Major Planning Documents

Metropolitan Transportation Plan (MTP) Development

Including its associated Air Quality Conformity Analysis Methodology, and Air Quality Conformity Determination

- The development phase is open and continuous through engagement via:
 - o TAC discussions
 - Open web-based public comments and surveys. https://www.belomar.org/open_comments/
 - Mail or in-person submissions to the office



- Public Engagement Milestones:
 - o One Public Open House during new plan development
 - One Public Open House during the draft project listing phase
 - Public notice of the approaching comment deadline issued at least 15 days prior to noon on the day of the preceding TAC meeting before Policy Committee adoption consideration
- Visualizations, maps, or other analysis can be conducted upon request

TIP Development

Including associated Air Quality Conformity Analysis Methodology, and Air Quality Conformity Determination

- The development phase is open and continuous through engagement via:
 - TAC discussions
 - o The open comment portal. https://www.belomar.org/open_comments/
 - Mail or in-person submissions to the office
- Public Engagement Milestones:
 - One Open House during the draft project listing phase
 - Public notice of the approaching comment deadline issued at least 15 days prior to noon on the day of the preceding TAC meeting before Policy Committee adoption consideration
- Visualizations, maps, or other analysis can be conducted upon request

Public Notices

- Notices of all open houses designed to gather participation from the public shall be posted at least 15 days before the meeting date to ensure broad awareness and participation.
- Notices will posted on Facebook, the Belomar website, and the local newspaper.

Public Participation and Civil Rights Plan (Belomar 3-C Plan) Development

- The development phase is open and continuous through engagement via:
 - TAC discussions
 - The open comment portal. https://www.belomar.org/open_comments/
 - o Mail or in-person submissions to the office
- Public Engagement Milestones:



 Public notice of the approaching comment deadline issued at least 45 days prior to noon on the day of the preceding TAC meeting before Policy Committee adoption consideration

Procedures for Late Comments and Comments Received After Publication

- All late comments will be presented to the TAC for review at a later meeting.
- The TAC will recommend further disposition of comments to the public and Policy Committee based on their merit and impact.
- If a comment is determined to have significant merit and impact, the TAC may recommend that the Policy Committee redevelop, amend, or make technical modifications to the relevant plan.

Commitment to Consistency in Public Engagement

Belomar ensures predictability and reliability in public participation through:

- Standardized comment submission methods across all planning products
- Consistent document formatting and publication standards for clarity and accessibility
- Regular meeting schedules for TAC and Policy Committee discussions
 - TAC meetings are regularly held at the Belomar office address on the Wednesday (prior to the second to last Thursday) at 1:30 PM of February, April, June, and October.
 - Interested parties and the public are invited to attend and participate.
- Transparent and repeated notifications of key decision points through official channels
- Aiming to host Public Open Houses at consistent locations that balance geographic centrality and accessibility for families and zero-vehicle households
 - Once a consistent location is established, it can be added to this plan as the consistent open house location.
- Suggesting broader and comprehensive accessibility improvements to the managers of these locations.

By adhering to these structured procedures, Belomar upholds its commitment to an open, accessible, and structured planning process that welcomes public input at every stage.



Conclusion

Belomar's 3-C Plan aims to foster an open, legally compliant transportation planning process. Through meaningful public participation, we ensure that transportation projects reflect community needs and priorities while upholding all civil rights protections.

Belomar commits to innovative engagement methods that expand participation beyond traditional meetings, ensuring a more open and representative transportation planning process.



Appendix 1: Glossary of Common Technical Transportation Terms



Glossary of Common Transportation Terms, Definitions, and Acronyms

A

- **ADA (Americans with Disabilities Act)** A federal law that prohibits discrimination based on disability and ensures accessible transportation options.
- Air Quality Conformity A process that ensures transportation plans and projects meet Clean Air Act requirements to improve or maintain air quality.
- **Amendment** A major revision to the TIP that involves adding or removing projects or making significant changes to scope, cost, or schedule.
- Administrative Modification A minor revision that does not require public review, such as small cost changes or project timeline adjustments.

В

- **Bel-O-Mar Regional (Belomar)** The regional infrastructure planning and development agency Belmont County, OH, and Ohio, Marshall, and Wetzel counties in WV.
- Belomar Transportation Study or MPO (Metropolitan Planning Organization) The regional agency responsible for transportation planning in Belmont County, OH, and Ohio and Marshall counties in WV.
- **Bicycle and Pedestrian Facilities** Infrastructure that supports walking and cycling, including bike lanes, sidewalks, and shared-use paths.

\mathbf{C}

- CAA (Clean Air Act) Federal legislation that regulates air pollutants and requires transportation projects to comply with air quality standards.
- Capital Improvement Program (CIP) A plan that outlines major infrastructure investments over multiple years.
- Congestion Management Process (CMP) A systematic process to manage traffic congestion and improve transportation system performance.

\mathbf{E}

- Eastern Ohio Regional Transit Authority (EORTA) The public transportation bus rapid transit system that provides services to Belmont County, Ohio.
- E-STIP (Electronic Statewide Transportation Improvement Program) The online system used in Ohio to manage TIP and STIP amendments and modifications.

F

• FHWA (Federal Highway Administration) – The federal agency overseeing highway and transportation funding and regulations.

- **Fiscal Constraint** A requirement that the TIP only includes projects with identified and available funding sources.
- **FMIS** (Financial Management Information System) The federal system used to track obligations and expenditures of transportation funds.
- FTA (Federal Transit Administration) The federal agency that supports public transit development and operations.

L

- Long-Range Transportation Plan (LRTP) A planning document that outlines transportation investments and policies over a 20+ year period.
- Locally Administered Project A project managed by a local government or agency using federal or state funds.

M

- **Maintenance Area** A geographic area that previously did not meet air quality standards but is now in compliance and requires continued monitoring.
- **Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO)** A regional entity responsible for coordinating transportation planning and funding.
- **Mobility** The ability of people and goods to move efficiently through a transportation system.
- Mode A type of transportation, such as driving, walking, cycling, or public transit.

N

- **NEPA** (National Environmental Policy Act) Federal law requiring environmental assessments for transportation projects.
- **Nonattainment Area** A region that does not meet federally mandated air quality standards.

$\mathbf{0}$

- **Obligation** A commitment of federal transportation funds to a specific project or program.
- **ODOT (Ohio Department of Transportation)** The state agency overseeing transportation projects and policies in West Virginia.
- **Ohio STIP Revision Guidelines** The procedures governing changes to the Statewide Transportation Improvement Program in Ohio.
- Ohio Valley Regional Transit Authority (OVRTA) The public transportation bus rapid transit system that provides services to Ohio and Marshall counties in West Virginia.

- **Performance Measures** Quantitative indicators used to assess the effectiveness of transportation investments.
- **Public Participation Plan (PPP)** A document that outlines how the public will be involved in the transportation planning process.

S

- Statewide Transportation Improvement Program (STIP) A federally required, four-year transportation investment plan developed by state DOTs.
- **Suballocated Funds** Federal or state funds designated for use by local governments within an MPO region.
- Surface Transportation Block Grant (STBG) A flexible federal funding program that supports a variety of transportation projects.

T

- TIP (Transportation Improvement Program) A short-term, federally required document that lists transportation projects planned for implementation in a four-year period.
- **Transportation Conformity** A requirement ensuring that transportation projects comply with air quality standards.
- Transit-Oriented Development (TOD) A planning strategy that promotes compact, walkable communities centered around public transit.

 \mathbf{W}

• WVDOT (West Virginia Department of Transportation) – The state agency overseeing transportation projects and policies in West Virginia.

Explanation of Acronyms

- Advance Construction High Priority (ACHP) 80% Federal / 20% Local
- Advance Construction (ACST) 80% Federal / 20% Local
- August Redistribution (AUG REDI) TBD Federal
- Bridge Replacement and Rehabilitation (BR) 80% Federal / 20% Local
- Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality (CMAQ) 80-90% Federal / 10-20% Local
- Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality, PM 2.5 (CMAQ 2.5) 80% Federal / 20% Local
- Carbon Reduction Program (CRP) 80-100% Federal / 0-20% Local
- Emergency Relief Program (ER) 80-100% Federal / 0-20% Local
- Highway Safety Improvement Program (HSIP) 80-90% Federal / 10-20% Local
- National Highway Freight Program (NHFP) 80-90% Federal / 10-20% Local
- National Highway Performance Program (NHPP) 80-90% Federal / 10-20% Local

- National Highway Performance Program (Exempt) (NHPP-EXE) 90% Federal / 10% Local
- National Highway System (NHS) 80% Federal / 20% Local
- Recreational Trails (NRT) 80% Federal / 20% Local
- Railroad Crossings/Highway Crossings (RR/HWY XI) 90% Federal / 10% Local
- FTA Formula (Operating/Capital) (Section 5307) 50/80% Federal / 50/20% Local
- FTA Discretionary Capital Grant (Section 5309) 80% Federal / 20% Local
- FTA Elderly/Handicapped Capital Grants (Section 5310) 80% Federal / 20% Local
- Bus and Bus Facilities Program (Section 5339) 50% Federal / 50% Local
- Surface Transportation Block Grant Program (STBG) 80-90% Federal / 10-20% Local
- Surface Transportation Program (STP) 80% Federal / 20% Local
- Surface Transportation Program Off System Bridge (STP-OFF) 80% Federal / 20% Local
- Transportation Alternatives Program (TAP) 80-90% Federal / 10-20% Local
- **Population Range (# POP)** 80-90% Federal / 10-20% Local
- Flexible Funds (FLEX) 80-90% Federal / 10-20% Local
- Transportation Management Area (TMA) 80% Federal / 20% Local
- Highway Infrastructure Program (HIP) 80% Federal / 20% Local

The maximum share of project costs that may be funded with Federal-aid highway funds (the "Federal share") varies based upon the Federal-aid program from which the project receives funding. In some cases, the Federal share is also adjusted based on related statutory provisions.

- Engineering (ENG) Design and technical planning for a transportation project.
- **Right of Way (ROW)** Land acquisition for transportation improvements.
- Construction (CON) The phase of physically building transportation infrastructure.
- **Feasibility Study (FS)** A study to determine the viability of a proposed transportation project.
- Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) A document that assesses potential environmental effects of a project.
- **Beginning Mile Point/Miles (BMP/mi)** Measurement unit indicating the start location or length of a project.

Project Name / Type of Work

- **Bridge (BR)** Infrastructure for crossing over roads, railways, or water.
- Clean & Paint (C&P) Maintenance process for extending infrastructure lifespan.
- Overlay (O/L) Resurfacing pavement to improve road conditions.
- **Inspection (INSP)** Evaluating existing infrastructure for safety and maintenance needs.
- Interchange (I/C) A highway junction allowing smooth traffic flow between roads.
- **Turnpike (TPK)** A tolled roadway system.
- North/South/East/West Bound (N/S/E/WB) Directional indicators for travel.

Agencies

- Eastern Ohio Regional Transit Authority (EORTA) The public transportation bus rapid transit system that provides services to Belmont County, Ohio.
- **ODOT (Ohio Department of Transportation)** The state agency overseeing transportation projects and policies in West Virginia.
- Ohio Valley Regional Transit Authority (OVRTA) The public transportation bus rapid transit system that provides services to Ohio and Marshall counties in West Virginia.
- West Virginia Department of Transportation (WVDOT) State agency overseeing transportation projects in West Virginia.
- West Virginia Division of Highways (WVDOH) Division within WVDOT managing highways and infrastructure.
- Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) Federal agency managing national highway funding and regulations.
- United States Department of Transportation (USDOT) Federal agency overseeing all modes of transportation.

This glossary provides key definitions to support understanding of transportation planning terms referenced in the TIP and related documents. Additional terms and explanations can be provided upon request.*The maximum share of project costs that may be funded with Federal-aid highway funds (the "Federal share") varies based upon the Federal-aid program from which the project receives funding. In some cases, the Federal share is also adjusted based on related statutory provisions (23 U.S.C. 120).

Phase of Work / Other

- **ENG** Engineering
- **ROW** Right of Way
- **CON** Construction
- **FS** Feasibility Study
- **EIS** Environmental Impact Statement
- **BMP/mi** Beginning Mile Point/miles (unit)

Project Name/ Type of Work

- **BR** Bridge
- C&P Clean & Paint
- O/L Overlay
- **INSP** Inspection
- I/C Interchange
- **TPK** Turnpike
- N/S/E/WB North/South/East/West Bound

Agencies

- WVDOT West Virginia Department of Transportation
- WVDOH West Virginia Division of Highways

- **OVRTA** Ohio Valley Regional Transit Authority
- **ODOT** Ohio Department of Transportation
- **EPA** Environmental Protection Agency
- **OEPA** Ohio EPA
- WVDEP WV Department of Environmental Protection
- FHWA Federal Highway Administration
- FTA Federal Transit Administration
- USDOT United States Department of Transportation

This glossary provides key definitions to support understanding of transportation planning terms referenced in the TIP and other core transportation planning documents. Additional terms and explanations can be provided upon request.